# ORDER SHEET WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

#### Present-

The Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal (Chairman)

& The Hon'ble Mr. P. Ramesh Kumar (Administrative Member)

#### Case No - <u>OA 615 OF 2019</u>

DHIMAN BISWAS <u>Vs</u> The State of West Bengal & Ors.

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature
1		of parties when necessary
	For the Applicant : Mr. K. Bhattacharya,	3
3	Mr. S.K. Pal,	
19.09.2019	Mrs. S. Agarwal,	
19.09.2019	Advocates	
	For the State Respondent : Mr. S.K. Mondal, Advocate	
	Advocate	
	For the Respondent No. 3: Mr. M.N. Ray,	
	Advocate	
	Let affidavit of service filed be kept on record.	
	In this application the applicant, a Wireless	
	Supervisor (Technical) Grade-II of West Bengal Police	
	Telecommunication, has prayed for certain reliefs, the	
	relevant portion of which is as under:	
	"(a) To set aside and quash the order	
	dated 09.08.2019 being memo	
	bearing Org No.319 / RO passed	
	by the Respondent no.3 being	
	annexure "P-8" to this	
	application;	
	(b) To keep the posting of the applicant	
	at Barasat Police District till such	
	reconsideration of the	
	representation made by the	

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
	applicant."	
	It is submitted by Mr. K. Bhattacharya, learned	
	advocate for the applicant that though the Hon'ble High	
	Court, on 8 <sup>th</sup> July, 2019 had dismissed the writ petition	
	being W.P.S.T. No. 62 of 2019 : Dhiman Biswas Vs. The	
	State of West Bengal & Ors., filed by the applicant against	
	the order of the Tribunal passed on 23 <sup>rd</sup> August, 2018 in	
	O.A. No. 605 of 2018: Dhiman Biswas Vs. The State of	
	West Bengal & Ors., however, in the context of the case	
	as liberty was granted to the petitioner to approach the	
	authority with relevant documents in support of the illness	
	of the petitioner's wife, and it was directed if such an	
	approach is made, it would be disposed of in accordance	
	with law, appropriate order may be passed. The relevant	
	portion of the order passed in W.P.S.T. No.62 of 2019 on	
	8 <sup>th</sup> July, 2019 is as under:-	
	"The conduct of the petitioner does	
	not inspire us to entertain the writ petition	
	and examine the first and third contentions.	
	If, indeed, the petitioner was aggrieved by the	
	order of the tribunal dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> August, 2018,	
	he should have immediately approached the	
	writ Court, as referred to above. However,	
	having taken advantage of a part of the order	
	dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> August, 2018, the petitioner cannot	
	be heard to complain that the tribunal was in	

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	error in not accepting his first and third	
	contentions. Although the Laws of	
	Limitation do not apply to writ proceedings,	
	it is well settled that the writ Court has to be	
	approached with utmost expedition and at	
	any rate, within a reasonable period of	
	accrual of the cause of action. The cause of	
	action having arisen in August, 2018 and the	
	writ petition having been filed more than	
	eight months thereafter, the delay and laches	
	in moving this Court are considered to be	
	relevant factors standing in the way of the	
	petitioner for grant of relief.	
	The writ petition stands dismissed.	
	There shall be no order as to costs.	
	This order shall, however, not	
	prevent the petitioner from approaching the	
	concerned authority with relevant documents	
	in support of the illness of the petitioner's	
	wife and if such an approach is made, we	
	hope and trust that the same shall be disposed	
	of in accordance with law."	
	Thereafter, pursuant to the liberty granted by the	
	High Court, the applicant had filed an application on 29 <sup>th</sup>	
	July, 2019 before the Additional Director General &	
	Inspector General of Police, Telecommunication, West	

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	Bengal, Kolkata, which was disposed of by an order, the	
	relevant portion of which is as under:	
	"Please inform Shri Dhiman	
	Biswas, Inspector (Telecom), Barasat Police	
	District that his prayer dated 29/07/2019 to	
	continue at Barasat Telecom Station, Barasat	
	Police District is "REGRETTED" after careful	
	consideration(.) He should join his new place of	
	posting immediately(.) For information and	
	necessary action(.)"	
	It is submitted by Mr. K. Bhattacharya, learned	
	advocate for the applicant that as evidently the order is	
	cryptic it may be quashed. In support of his submission	
	he has referred to the order passed by the Hon'ble	
	Supreme Court in Ram Phal Versus State of Haryana :	
	(2009) 3 SCC 258.	
	Mr. M.N. Ray, learned advocate appearing on	
	behalf of the respondent no.3 submits that earlier the	
	applicant had filed an Original Application, being O.A.	
	605 of 2018: Dhiman Biswas Vs. The State of West	
	Bengal & Ors., challenging his order of transfer dated 24 <sup>th</sup>	
	July, 2018 from Barasat P.D. to Diamond Harbour, which	
	was disposed of by the Tribunal on 23 <sup>rd</sup> August, 2018 by	
	directing the authorities to keep the order in abeyance till	
	the completion of Higher Secondary Examinations of the	

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	son of the applicant in 2019 and also it was directed once	
	the examination was over, he should join the transferred	
	place of posting. The relevant portion of the said order is	
	as follows:	
	"Since his son is going to appear	
	in the Higher Secondary Examinations	
	in the year 2019, considering that fact,	
	this application is disposed of by	
	directing the Additional Director	
	General (L & O) & holding additional	
	charge of IGP(HQ), West Bengal, - the	
	Respondent No. 3 to keep this order of	
	transfer of the applicant from Barasat	
	Police District to Diamond Harbour	
	Police District in abeyance till the	
	completion of Higher Secondary	
	Examinations of the son of the	
	applicant in the year 2019.	
	It is made clear that once the	
	examinations of the son are over, the	
	applicant shall immediately join the	
	duty at the transferred place."	
	Submission is challenging the order, the	
	applicant had moved the High Court. As noted, the said	
	writ petition was dismissed on 8 <sup>th</sup> July, 2019 and though	
	liberty granted to the applicant to approach the concerned	

Serial No. and Date of order. 1	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary 3
	authority and file representation with relevant documents	
	in support of the illness of the petitioner's wife for	
	consideration of the authorities, since the applicant has	
	accepted the order of the Tribunal and did not join the	
	transferred place of posting and as the authority has to run	
	the administration, no order may be passed.	
	Heard learned advocates for the parties. It	
	appears that earlier the applicant had moved the Tribunal	
	challenging the order of transfer dated 24 <sup>th</sup> July, 2018	
	from Barasat P.D. to Diamond Harbour, which was	
	disposed of by the Tribunal on 23 <sup>rd</sup> August 2018, by	
	directing the authorities to keep the order in abeyance till	
	the completion of Higher Secondary Examinations of	
	2019 of the son of the applicant and directing the	
	applicant to join immediately after examination of the son	
	was over. Challenging the said order the applicant had	
	filed a writ petition, being W.P.S.T. No. 62 of 2019,	
	which was disposed of by passing order dated 8 <sup>th</sup> July,	
	2019.	
	It is true that the respondent authorities after	
	consideration of the documents had "regretted" the prayer	
	of the applicant and had directed him to join the place of	
	posting immediately and no reason has been given with	
	regard to the rejection of such order. However, keeping in	
	mind the order passed on 24 <sup>th</sup> July, 2018 by the Tribunal	

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order.	2	and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
	which has not been interfered with by the High Court and	
	since the applicant had accepted the order of the Tribunal	
	that he should immediately join his transferred place of	
CON	posting, this application is disposed of by setting aside the	
SCN	order, appearing at page 76 of the application, and by	
	directing the respondents to consider the matter afresh and	
	shall pass an order after giving an opportunity of hearing.	
	However, since the applicant had accepted the order	
	passed by the Tribunal that he would immediately join the	
	transferred place of posting, we are not inclined to	
	interfere with the order of transfer. However, the	
	authority shall grant leave to the applicant for appearing at	
	the hearing.	
	(P. Ramesh Kumar)(Soumitra Pal)MEMBER (A)CHAIRMAN	